Media Portrayals of Minorities Project

Appendix to the Report on Media Portrayals

2020 Newspaper Coverage of African Americans, Asian Americans, Native Americans, Latinos, Jews, and Muslims

Authors: Erik Bleich, Emma Brown, Abigail Chang, Lukas Kauth, Kai Milici, Nicolas Pantelick, Emily Wander, and A. Maurits van der Veen
Data Visualizations: A. Maurits van der Veen
Layout & Design: Diana Diaz and Abigail Chang

Methodology

Collecting Our Data

We used LexisNexis, NexisUni, ProQuest, and Factiva databases to identify articles from all sections of *The New York Times*, *The Washington Post*, *The Wall Street Journal*, or *USA Today* between January 1, 2016 and December 31, 2020 that contain root words associated with each of our groups. These root words are as follows (with an * indicating a search for words with any one or more letter following the root):

African Americans: "Afr* American*" OR "Afr*-American*" OR "blackness" OR "blacks" OR "anti-black" "majority-black" OR "minority-black" OR "bipoc" OR "blacklivesmatter" OR "black" as an adjective combined with a wide range of nouns from "American*" to "worker*"
Asian Americans: "Asian American*" OR "Asian-American*"
Native Americans: "Native American*" OR "American Indian*"
Latinos: Latino* OR Latina* OR Latinx* OR Hispanic*
Jews: Jew OR Jews OR Jewish* OR Jewry OR Judai* OR Jewess*
Muslims: Muslim* OR Islam*

We subsequently eliminated articles unrelated to our topics of interest by dropping those containing only mentions of unrelated words such as "Latinate" or "Islamabad." We did not search for root words such as "Chinese American" or "Mexican American" that would capture subsets of our groups; we did not include words like "Torah" or "Quran" that invoke but do not name Jews or Muslims; and we excluded "black" by itself because it is present in a large number of articles unrelated to African Americans. These choices ensure that all articles in our dataset are directly related to our groups of interest. We retained all articles for our five-year analyses, and created a separate set of articles from 2020 for our one-year analyses.

Topic Modeling & Features

To identify general themes within our media data, we used latent semantic analysis with non-negative matrix factorization. We ran topic models on the 2020 data for each of our six groups. We iterated between 10-15 topics, and selected the number of topics with maximum coherence within that range. Topics are associated with weighted lists of words; we focus on the top 25 words for each topic.

There were a series of topics that recurred across all groups related to six general themes: culture, education, economics, politics, bigotry, and law and order. Using the results of the topic modeling, we created a list of words associated with each theme. Each article was then assessed for the presence of one or more words related to the theme, and tagged for the thematic feature if a related word was present in the article.

Through our process, we create "features" for each concept. This allows us to identify articles containing one or more of the words associated with each feature. The feature words associated with each general theme are (with an * indicating a search for words with any one or more letter following the root):

Culture: artist*, museum*, exhibition*, galler*, painting*, sculpture*, architecture, opera, musical, film, movie*, art, arts, mural*, theater*

Education: education*, student*, academi*, professor*, teacher*, school*, standardized test*, college*, universit*, graduat*, alum*, admissio*, teach, taught, teaching

Economics: unemploy*, econom*, job*, wage*, recession, market, employ*, tax, taxes, worker*, trade, trading, labor*

Politics: democrat*, republican*, governor*, gubernat*, candidate*, senat*, congress*, donald trump*, donald j trump*, president trump*, biden*, campaign*, vote*, voting, ballot*, politic*, elect, elects, elected, election*, electoral

Bigotry: racis*, bigot*, discriminat*, prejudice*, hate group*, hate crime*, xenopho*, anti immigra*, anti-immigra*, antiimmigra*, antisemit*, anti-semit*, anti semit*, islamophobia, islamophobic, islamophobe*, anti muslim, anti-muslim, antimuslim, antiblack*, anti-black*, anti black*

Law and order: police*, crime*, criminal*, law enforce*, prison*, jail*, arrest*, court, courts, attorney, legal, jury, juries, juror*, verdict*, prosecutor*, convict*, testif*, lawyer*, robber*, rape*, manslaughter*, homici*, assault*, kidnap*, burglar*, theft*, felon*, misdemeanor*, drug possession, unarm*, shooting*, shooter*, incarcerat*

In addition, given the significance of the coronavirus in 2020, we include a seventh common feature for this year:

Coronavirus: covid*, coronavirus*, anti-covid*, anticovid*, anti covid*, sars-cov-2, vaccin*, pandemic*

Below we present the top 25 words associated with each topic for the individual groups. We exclude topics that do not capture an identifiable concept. These results provide the foundation for identifying the general themes, and also reveal specific themes associated with each group. Following the list of topics, we provide the features we generated to explore the presence and associations with each specific theme for the group.

African Americans

Topics
- Topic 1: know, life, mother, family, really, think, feel, things, going, got, want, love, lot, wanted, home, father, work, day, young, world, felt, friends, woman, good, thing
- Topic 2: trump, president, republican, house, democrats, campaign, republicans, obama, senate, democratic, party, political, donald, administration, clinton, presidential, parliamentx, politics, election, committee, senator, capitalx, leader, biden, democrat
- Topic 3: police, officers, officer, shooting, department, city, shot, protests, protesters, killed, floyd, enforcement, video, man, violence, death, mayor, killing, gun, minneapolis, force, policing, shootings, fired, officials
- Topic 4: students, schools, school, education, student, teachers, college, high, university, admissions, parents, children, colleges, campus, academic, test, public, class, teacher, charter, district, universities, classes, scores, hispanic
- Topic 5: museum, art, exhibition, gallery, artists, artist, org, arts, paintings, works, nw, val, collection, ave, painting, st, pm, contemporary, xxedu, avenue, street, sculpture, photographs, xxi, center
- Topic 6: history, civil, war, slavery, rights, confederate, americans, america, racial, racism, states, nation, united, movement, south, country, slaves, african, slave, statue, book,

freedom, monuments, university, king
- Topic 7: court, case, judge, attorney, prosecutors, trial, justice, law, supreme, prison, jury, legal, lawyers, criminal, charges, lawyer, cases, convicted, state, decision, rights, prosecutor, district, guilty, evidence
- Topic 8: players, nfl, league, sports, team, game, football, season, kaepernick, player, anthem, teams, games, coach, nba, athletes, basketball, quarterback, coaches, fans, baseball, play, sport, colin, played
- Topic 9: dollar, economic, jobs, housing, 000, workers, economy, rate, income, pay, residents, market, unemployment, city, money, tax, financial, business, businesses, growth, labor, government, neighborhoods, job, benefits
- Topic 10: sanders, biden, warren, democratic, voters, candidates, buttigieg, campaign, iowa, bernie, primary, candidate, senator, hampshire, harris, presidential, klobuchar, vice, race, south, polls, debate, bloomberg, nomination, carolina
- Topic 11: voters, vote, voting, election, voter, republican, elections, democrats, republicans, turnout, state, votes, ballots, democratic, ballot, polls, party, georgia, poll, governor, voted, polling, win, states, county
- Topic 12: film, movie, theater, movies, films, music, comedy, musical, drama, production, series, hollywood, star, play, directed, actor, netflix, plays, director, awards, broadway, oscar, story, actors, season
- Topic 13: health, coronavirus, virus, pandemic, disease, patients, medical, deaths, cases, risk, care, testing, vaccine, hospital, data, infections, rates, tested, doctors, experts, states, infection, infected, study, masks
- Topic 14:: company, companies, employees, media, facebook, diversity, executive, social, chief, women, online, tech, twitter, statement, executives, users, industry, content, post, google, business, technology, groups, group, information

Group-specific features
- *Protest*: protest, protests, protested, protesting, protester*, protestor*
- *Police*: police, policing
- *George Floyd*: floyd
- *BLM*: blm, black lives matter, blacklivesmatter

Asian Americans

Topics:
- Topic 1: coronavirus, trump, americans, pandemic, china, virus, health, public, chinese, united, know, state, community, day, city, world, home, week, going, officials, family, social, california, police, want
- Topic 2: voters, georgia, democrats, turnout, vote, election, voter, democratic, republican, voting, party, republicans, biden, electorate, 2016, state, ballot, votes, elections, senate, trump, political, ballots, voted, polls
- Topic 3: admissions, harvard, yale, applicants, court, affirmative, students, supreme, university, lawsuit, justice, universities, race, department, action, fair, filed, policies, judge, admission, case, plaintiffs, college, investigation, colleges
- Topic 4: motion, actress, awkwafina, hollywood, picture, actor, 1917, awards, best, award, golden, farewell, comedy, degeneres, musical, parasite, drama, fleabag, ramy, succession, chernobyl, globe, performance, gervais, television
- Topic 5: schools, students, blasio, learning, school, classrooms, remote, teachers, in-

struction, children, mayor, city, parents, families, classes, reopen, educators, hybrid, classroom, reopening, education, districts, district, high, buildings
- Topic 6: harris, biden, mate, ticket, vice, running, kamala, woman, campaign, presidential, democratic, senator, selection, candidate, voters, women, joe, party, pick, trump, obama, choice, sen, nominee, advisers
- Topic 7: sanders, iowa, hampshire, nevada, buttigieg, caucuses, vegas, las, candidates, bloomberg, klobuchar, voters, bernie, democratic, primary, caucus, campaign, candidate, super, warren, biden, saturday, senator, polls, mayor
- Topic 8: ng, marlins, baseball, manager, sport, kim, miami, sports, general, yankees, hiring, dodgers, jeter, mlb, female, woman, burden, obtain, operations, women, player, major, league, men, grain
- Topic 9: broadway, theater, theaters, actors, stages, directors, report, season, performers, wing, dominate, shows, hitchens, nominators, overrepresentation, hadestown, roles, color, exponential, musicals, inclusivity, negotiated, casts, strive, cast
- Topic 10: carlson, neff, tucker, fox, blake, duckworth, posts, autoadmit, memo, misogynist, patriotism, resigned, writings, sexist, tonight, forum, dartmouth, viewership, advertisers, condemned, abhorrent, moron, writer, news, vacation
- Topic 11: payne, finalists, translated, yu, fiction, literature, award, nonfiction, reidy, mccullers, millet, tamara, les, arising, literary, malcolm, interior, mosley, awards, saunt, claudio, shapland, philyaw, jerald, villavicencio
- Topic 12: goyal, darlene, hospitalized, pediatrics, infected, malbari, children, cdc, susceptibility, figueroa, severely, diarrhea, underlying, maldonado, symptoms, sinai, tested, medicine, infections, frontline, antibodies, rates, disease, ill, infection

Group-specific features
- *Model minority*: prominen*, elit*, success*, model minorit*, achieve*, excellen*

Native Americans

Topics:
- Topic 1: black, public, trump, world, think, school, dollar, day, city, america, life, family, united, know, university, women, nation, house, long, going, home, want, called, help, pandemic
- Topic 2: team, snyder, nfl, redskins, football, stadium, sports, franchise, league, fedex, capitalx, teams, change, fans, logo, owner, sponsors, names, mascots, cleveland, mascot, indians, racist, nickname, slur
- Topic 3: nw, xxi, xxedu, exhibited, sw, exhibition, org, ave, museum, avenue, artist, pl, art, artists, gallery, xxn, baltimore, independence, st, tapestry, works, anniversary, artistic, spacesuit, paintings
- Topic 4: health, vaccine, virus, disease, coronavirus, medical, patients, cdc, vaccines, testing, cases, deaths, care, rates, pandemic, hospital, risk, higher, infected, trials, infections, prevention, data, hospitals, rate
- Topic 5: org, exhibition, monkman, metmuseum, cotter, farago, art, rex, museum, bacchus, paintings, schreier, metropolitan, artist, denes, collection, auschwitz, objects, elaborately, kent, pieces, fashion, marvels, artists, decorated
- Topic 6: horwitz, asne, assailants, sari, loopholes, rectify, indian, prosecuted, assaulted, prosecution, inability, recipient, uncovered, fails, legal, sexually, distinguished, villages, failures, jurisdiction, headline, tragedy, award, product, journey

- Topic 7: statue, statues, monuments, columbus, protesters, confederate, monument, roosevelt, removal, removed, remove, museum, theodore, toppled, police, christopher, floyd, figures, mayor, jefferson, protests, city, symbols, george, richmond
- Topic 8: court, oklahoma, creek, supreme, justices, ruling, mcgirt, gorsuch, justice, case, tribal, decision, reservation, jurisdiction, crimes, muscogee, prosecute, law, sovereignty, courts, criminal, murphy, tribes, circuit, nation
- Topic 9: block, board, dartmouth, chairman, james, member, smithsonian, smithson, museum, institution, dalton, cum, laude, doting, 70th, ywha, wangrow, ym, 10021, pecker, committee, nonprescription, stearns, phi, beta
- Topic 10: voters, biden, democratic, election, democrats, trump, republican, voting, campaign, republicans, party, vote, sanders, presidential, senator, ballots, ballot, candidate, candidates, votes, senate, voter, 2016, elections, warren

Group-specific features
- *Renaming*: redskins, chicago blackhawks, kansas city chiefs, cleveland indians, atlanta braves, washington nfl, nfl, football
- *Statue*: statue*, monument*

Latinos

Topics:
- Topic 1: virus, cases, coronavirus, testing, masks, tested, positive, city, health, deaths, spread, officials, reopening, outbreak, residents, reopen, infections, tests, 000, gov, county, restrictions, weeks, distancing, pandemic
- Topic 2: biden, trump, voters, democrats, democratic, election, republican, campaign, 2016, republicans, party, vote, clinton, florida, points, win, presidential, political, polls, senate, votes, arizona, poll, joe, support
- Topic 3: unemployment, economy, jobs, workers, economic, dollar, benefits, labor, recession, businesses, job, economists, recovery, economist, pandemic, rate, aid, employment, market, unemployed, jobless, income, households, financial, business
- Topic 4: police, officers, protests, officer, floyd, protesters, department, enforcement, minneapolis, policing, city, law, violence, george, shooting, mayor, crime, arrested, death, man, protest, killed, shot, attorney, killing
- Topic 5: sanders, buttigieg, bloomberg, warren, iowa, hampshire, klobuchar, super, bernie, nevada, primary, caucuses, tuesday, candidates, biden, democratic, delegates, voters, campaign, pete, south, carolina, candidate, senator, mayor
- Topic 6: students, schools, school, teachers, learning, education, parents, children, remote, classrooms, classes, districts, instruction, families, student, teacher, educators, kids, district, classroom, reopen, high, reopening, elementary, admissions
- Topic 7: vaccine, vaccines, pfizer, doses, moderna, trials, vaccinated, trial, vaccination, fda, effective, shots, clinical, placebo, distribution, advisory, participants, authorization, drug, speed, warp, phase, dose, biontech, disease
- Topic 8: disease, patients, health, study, medical, rates, data, researchers, care, risk, higher, cdc, disparities, conditions, deaths, symptoms, coronavirus, age, virus, hospital, adults, diabetes, infected, medicine, underlying
- Topic 9: ballots, voting, voter, mail, ballot, election, elections, vote, voters, absentee, fraud, cast, polling, court, turnout, votes, counted, rights, november, suppression, registration, re-

publican, laws, supreme, county

Group-specific features:
- *Latino vote*: latino vot*, hispanic vot*, latino caucus, hispanic caucus, latino victory fund, hispanic turnout*
- *Bernie Sanders*: sanders*
- *Disparities*: disparit*, inequit*

Jews

Topics
- Topic 1: life, family, way, work, book, home, school, father, mother, know, war, children, wrote, told, university, story, history, think, day, long, young, black, love, died, good
- Topic 2: israel, palestinian, palestinians, arab, israeli, peace, netanyahu, trump, bank, emirates, jerusalem, annexation, east, iran, saudi, administration, relations, plan, west, diplomatic, bahrain, middle, israelis, state, minister
- Topic 3: virus, health, coronavirus, cases, cuomo, officials, city, blasio, restrictions, rate, mayor, pandemic, masks, schools, gatherings, state, brooklyn, positive, residents, neighborhoods, governor, testing, rates, 000, patients
- Topic 4: condolences, bressman, mourns, notice, ceo, extend, moore, goldstein, paid, deaths, passing, chair, board, eric, amy, beloved, heartfelt, family, entire, david, generosity, dear, community, president, legacy
- Topic 5: trump, biden, democratic, campaign, democrats, sanders, voters, president, election, republican, republicans, candidate, presidential, party, senator, candidates, vote, political, senate, bernie, supporters, primary, support, white, race
- Topic 6: police, attack, prosecutors, hate, crimes, attacks, court, killed, law, charged, violence, enforcement, authorities, officers, charges, attorney, shooting, arrested, terrorism, violent, trial, crime, officials, synagogue, terrorist
- Topic 7: museum, art, museums, exhibition, gallery, painting, artist, paintings, artists, arts, works, guston, collection, exhibitions, heirs, holocaust, curator, restitution, work, artworks, cultural, sculpture, curators, whitney, corrections
- Topic 8: org, exhibition, cotter, farago, rex, monkman, metmuseum, museum, denes, art, paintings, schreier, bacchus, objects, display, artist, collection, bones, artists, retrospective, teeth, kent, elaborately, pieces, exhibitions
- Topic 9: ginsburg, justice, bader, supreme, court, ruth, barrett, scalia, judge, mcconnell, confirmation, senate, nominee, justices, rbg, bench, icon, coney, women, seat, law, respects, capitol, antonin, republicans
- Topic 10: religious, court, supreme, justices, justice, religion, church, catholic, worship, churches, alito, amendment, ruling, roberts, case, rights, freedom, constitutional, opinion, gorsuch, restrictions, liberty, diocese, law, faith
- Topic 11: cooking, nyt, recipe, food, chicken, recipes, matzo, dishes, passover, pinterest, seder, meal, suggestions, shopping, dish, updates, menu, sweet, brisket, meat, advice, onions, soup, regular, instagram
- Topic 12: netanyahu, gantz, minister, prime, israeli, israel, coalition, benny, government, likud, benjamin, election, party, annexation, bank, elections, unity, trial, jerusalem, parties, political, corruption, blue, israelis, joint

Group-Specific Features
- *Holocaust*: holocaust*, nazi*, auschwitz, concentration camp*, hitler, ghetto
- *Food*: food, recipe, ingredient*, cooking
- *Orthodox*: orthodox*
- *Ruth Bader Ginsburg*: rbg, ruth bader ginsburg, justice ginsburg
- *Israel*: israel*, netanyahu, tel aviv, jerusalem
- *Normalization*: normaliz*
- *Art*: art, arts
- *Museum*: museum*
- *Anti-Semitism*: antisemit*, anti semit*, anti-semit*

Muslims

Topics:
- Topic 1: trump, white, york, political, house, police, way, black, national, public, family, election, told, biden, think, work, right, life, court, women, campaign, democratic, know, america, want
- Topic 2: iran, iranian, iraq, tehran, iraqi, suleimani, strike, soleimani, nuclear, baghdad, military, gen, killing, sanctions, revolutionary, trump, maj, iranians, militias, missile, militia, general, commander, drone, troops
- Topic 3: troops, military, pentagon, forces, somalia, africa, militants, operations, counterterrorism, defense, killed, fighters, soldiers, iraq, shabab, islamic, army, attacks, qaeda, al, syria, command, security, group, attack
- Topic 4: virus, coronavirus, health, cases, outbreak, pandemic, lockdown, infections, spread, testing, patients, tested, briefing, disease, workers, infected, restrictions, medical, deaths, masks, positive, hospitals, 000, reported, hospital
- Topic 5: taliban, afghan, afghanistan, kabul, peace, talks, ghani, negotiations, agreement, deal, withdrawal, prisoners, ashraf, forces, doha, afghans, troops, insurgents, violence, khalilzad, qatar, sides, abdullah, attacks, reduction
- Topic 6: french, france, macron, paris, hebdo, charlie, caricatures, prophet, cartoons, attack, muhammad, teacher, paty, islamist, emmanuel, satirical, police, terrorist, islam, separatism, attacks, darmanin, expression, 2015, secularism
- Topic 7: israel, israeli, palestinians, arab, palestinian, netanyahu, jerusalem, saudi, emirates, peace, bahrain, uae, arabia, bank, normalization, israelis, relations, diplomatic, east, annexation, west, gulf, benjamin, gaza, middle
- Topic 8: china, chinese, beijing, xinjiang, hong, kong, xi, communist, uighurs, uighur, trade, sanctions, administration, companies, jinping, camps, rights, pompeo, human, foreign, abuses, region, trump, party, ethnic
- Topic 9: india, modi, hindu, delhi, indian, narendra, hindus, citizenship, kashmir, muslims, minister, prime, bjp, nationalist, bharatiya, janata, indians, party, pakistan, violence, law, muslim, police, mobs, religious
- Topic 10: turkey, turkish, erdogan, libya, russia, syrian, hifter, russian, tripoli, syria, libyan, tayyip, idlib, recep, moscow, nato, ankara, mercenaries, istanbul, greece, mediterranean, european, putin, forces, hagia

Group-specific Features:
- *Conflict*: violen*, fight*, fighting, combat, war, wars, warring, insurgenc*, rebel*, militant*, killing*, killed, casualties

- *Crime*: crime*, criminal*, law enforce*, prison*, jail*, incarcerat*
- *Extremism*: extremis*, radical*, fundamentalis*, fanatic*, jihad*
- *Iran*: iran*, tehran, soleimani, suleimani
- *ISIS*: islamic state, isis, isil, daesh
- *Islamophobia*: islamophobia, islamophobic, islamophobe*
- *Israel/Palestine*: israel*, palestin*, netanyahu, jerusalem, annexation, west bank, gaza, hamas
- *Muslim ban*: muslim ban*, immigration ban*, travel ban*
- *Police*: police, policing
- *Syria*: syria*, assad
- *Terrorism*: terroris*, suicide bomb

Lexical Sentiment Analysis

Our lexical sentiment analysis method evaluates every word in each article to see whether it appears in a lexicon (dictionary) of positive or negative words. The overall sentiment of an article is calculated by summing the positive and negative impacts of the words in the text, and scaling by the overall length of the article (so we have a sense of the density of positive and negative words).

No single sentiment analysis dictionary will do a perfect job of capturing all the positive and negative connotations of words in a particular set of texts. Instead, a lexicon's strength can vary depending on the general subject of the texts under analysis, the writing style of the texts, etc. For this reason, we generate eight different measures of sentiment, using eight different, widely used sentiment dictionaries.

In addition, we take into account words that modify a sentiment, including negations (such as "not," "hardly," etc.) and intensifiers ("very," "extremely," etc.). When any one or more of these words directly precede a word in one of our lexica, the sentiment value of the latter is adjusted accordingly.

Next, in order to calibrate our sentiment values such that a 0 is equivalent to neutral sentiment, we have collected a large corpus of about 45,000 newspaper articles—with no restrictions as to subject or length—whose tone can be assumed to be representative of the average tone of newspaper articles in general. For each of our eight sentiment measures, we standardize the sentiments calculated for this representative corpus, so that the mean is 0 and the standard deviation is 1. Not only does this establish a neutral point for our sentiment—it also makes it possible to average our eight sentiment measures without biasing or overweighting the result towards any particular measure. We rescale the resulting measure to once again have a standard deviation of 1.

The same adjustments (individual standardization parameters as well as the final rescaling) can then be applied to any other set of texts, producing a sentiment value that is easily interpretable relative to the average US newspaper article.

Regression Analysis

We use standard ordinary least squares (OLS) multivariate regressions to estimate how strongly individual "features"—the presence of one or more words from a particular category in a text—are associated with more positive or more negative sentiment.

Our features simply code for the presence (1) or absence (0) of any one or more words from a category in a text. Since they are binary variables, the interpretation of the regression coefficients is relatively straightforward: the presence of a feature is associated with an expected increase in a text's aggregate sentiment by an amount equal to the regression coefficient.

Note that this expected increase is subject to some standard caveats, of which we briefly mention two. First, estimates of the expected impact of a rare feature and a common feature may differ even when in actual articles their effect is similar. Second, some features co-occur regularly. The rate of co-occurrence is not high enough to raise worries about multicollinearity, but it does mean that it is important to think about which estimated effects are likely to reinforce or, conversely, counteract one another.

Additional Data

Article count by group and publication, 2020

Number of articles with 1 or more and 3 or more mentions of the group, respectively

	New York Times		Washington Post		Wall Street Journal		USA Today		Total	
	1+	3+	1+	3+	1+	3+	1+	3+	1+	3+
African Americans	12,887	7,011	4,391	2,287	1,506	658	1,103	615	19,887	10,571
Asian Americans	755	149	173	33	62	16	59	11	1,049	209
Native Americans	1,349	254	438	90	163	21	124	25	2,074	390
Latinos	4,320	1,025	1,121	234	484	86	317	82	6,242	1,427
Jews	3,604	886	779	185	461	119	85	21	4,929	1,211
Muslims	3,911	1,126	1,230	303	603	154	102	19	5,846	1,602

Multivariate regression

Estimated associations between the six general themes and article tone

Theme	Estimated coefficient	Standard error
Culture	0.391	0.019
Education	0.237	0.019
Economics	-0.012	0.019
Politics	-0.075	0.021
Bigotry	-0.161	0.019
Law and order	-0.446	0.019
Constant	-0.145	0.025
Adjusted R-squared	0.122	
Number of articles	40,027	

All coefficients are statistically significant at the $p < 0.001$ level, except for the Economics theme, whose coefficient is not statistically significant.

Citations of Sources

Embedded URLs are accessible through the online version of the appendix at mediaandminorities.org/reports.

Summary of 2020 Findings

Page 1: Latinos and African Americans are the largest of these groups, constituting approximately 19% and 13% of the US population, respectively. Asian Americans are the next most numerous, at roughly 6%. Native Americans, Jews, and Muslims each make up approximately 1-2% of the American population.

    United States Census Bureau, 2019 estimates, accessed May 18, 2021.
    CIA World Factbook, accessed May 18, 2021.

Asian Americans

Page 12: The year brought increased reporting on anti-Asian racism and xenophobia due to COVID-19, including the former president's use of pandemic descriptors that contained racially, nationally, and culturally charged language.

    Weise, Elizabeth "Anti-Asian hashtags soared after Donald Trump first tied COVID-19 to China on Twitter, study shows," USA Today, March 18, 2021.
    Yam, Kimmy "New report finds 169 percent surge in anti-Asian hate crimes during the first quarter," NBC News, April 28, 2021.

Page 14: The concept of the "model minority"—sometimes called the "model minority myth"—refers to the stereotype that Asian Americans place a cultural emphasis on education, hard work, and discipline.

    Lee, Stacey J. "Behind the Model-Minority Stereotype: Voices of High- and Low-Achieving Asian American Students," Anthropology & Education Quarterly 25, no. 4 (1994): 413-29.

Page 14: Kamala Harris and Andrew Yang both campaigned for president before dropping out of the race in December 2019 and January 2020, respectively. Harris and Illinois Senator Tammy Duckworth, who is Thai American, were later in the running for Biden's vice presidential pick.

    Burns, Alexander; Flegenheimer, Matt; Lee, Jasmine C.; Lerer, Lisa; Martin, Jonathan "Who's Running for President in 2020," New York Times, April 8, 2020.
    Burns, Alexander "Joe Biden's Vice-Presidential Pick: Kamala Harris," New York Times, August 11, 2020.

Native Americans

Page 16: It rose to modestly negative scores in the following months and returned to an essentially neutral tone at the end of the year, when President-elect Biden announced the nomi-

nation of Deb Haaland to serve as Secretary of the Interior, the first Native American nominated to a cabinet post.

Eilperin, Juliet; Grandoni, Dino and Dennis, Brady. "With historic picks, Biden puts environmental justice front and center," Washington Post, December 17, 2020.

Page 17: 2020 was a record year for Native Americans chosen for Congress—six Native American candidates were elected, more than in any other year.

O'Cane, Caitlin. "A record-breaking 6 Native candidates were elected to Congress on Tuesday," CBS News, November 6, 2020.

Page 17: All together, the terms "vote" or "voting" were mentioned in 28% of articles, as a North Dakota tribe scored a voting rights victory in February and a high Native American voter turnout helped to flip Arizona to the Democrats in the 2020 presidential election.

Astor, Maggie. "North Dakota Tribes Score Key Voting Rights Victory," New York Times, February 13, 2020.

Astor, Maggie. "Native Americans Helped Flip Arizona. Can They Mobilize in Georgia?" New York Times, December 4, 2020.

Page 17: Gunfire broke out during a protest in Albuquerque to demand the removal of a statue of Juan de Oñate, the despotic conquistador of New Mexico.

Pogrebin, Robin. "Roosevelt Statue to be Removed from Museum of Natural History," New York Times, June 21, 2020, updated June 25, 2020.

Page 18: The negative scores can be attributed to coverage of teams such as the Washington Redskins, Cleveland Indians, Atlanta Braves, Chicago Blackhawks, and Kansas City Chiefs, which faced scrutiny for mascot names viewed by many as demeaning and offensive.

Brassil, Gillian R.; McDonnell Nieto del Rio, Guilia; Witz, Billy and Waldstein, David. "In Campaign Against Racism, Team Names Get New Scrutiny," New York Times, July 10, 2020, updated July 12, 2020.

Page 18: 46% of articles about Native Americans referenced the pandemic, which disproportionately affected Black, Indigenous, and People of Color.

Oppel, Richard A. Jr; Gebeloff, Robert; Lai, K.K. Rebecca; Wright, Will and Smith, Mitch. "The Fullest Look Yet at the Racial Inequity of Coronavirus," New York Times, July 5, 2020.

Latinos

Page 20: The power of the Latino vote was a major theme, given that Latinos were the largest group eligible to vote among those covered in this report.

Cilluffo, Anthony and Fry, Richard. "An early look at the 2020 electorate," Pew Research Center Social and Demographic Trends, accessed March 5, 2021.

Jews

Page 25: This focus was fueled by the December 28, 2019 Hanukkah attack at a rabbi's home, prompting coverage of violence against the Jewish community that lasted into the new year.

Liebson, Rebecca, Neil Vigdor, Michael Gold, and Eliza Shapiro. "5 Wounded in Stabbing

at Rabbi's Home in N.Y. Suburb," New York Times, December 28, 2019.

Page 25: The number of stories about Jews also increased in response to New York City Mayor Bill de Blasio's announcement of COVID-19 restrictions in nine zip codes home to large Hasidic communities.
     Bellafante, Ginia. "When Covid Flared Again in Orthodox Jewish New York," New York Times, October 5, 2020.

Page 27: While the drone strike that killed Soleimani was carried out by American forces, newspapers turned towards Israel as tensions escalated in the region.
     Hendrix, Steve. "Israelis quietly haill Soleimani killing as they brace for retaliation," Washington Post, January 3, 2020.

Page 27: Second, Israel's normalization of relations with a number of Arab states, including Saudi Arabia and the United Arab Emirates, became the object of US newspapers' focus when discussing President Trump's Middle East peace plan.
     The Editorial Board. "More Arab-Israeli Harmony," Wall Street Journal, September 11, 2020.

Page 27: January 27, 2020 marked the 75th anniversary of the liberation of the Auschwitz, prompting US newspapers to interview survivors, reflect on these historic atrocities, and examine the rise of anti-Semitism today.
     Santora, Marc. "75 Years After Auschwitz Liberation, Worry that 'Never Again' is not Assured," New York Times, January 25, 2020.

Page 27: The death of Supreme Court Justice Ruth Bader Ginsburg on September 18 accounted for 12% of Jewish articles that month.
     Greenhouse, Linda. "Ruth Bader Ginsbury, Supreme Court's Feminist Icon, Is Dead at 87," New York Times, September 18, 2020.

Muslims

Page 28: Beginning in the fall, coverage shifted to ongoing international events, for example, in France, where fears of Islamic "separatism" fomented both significant nationalistic outcry and claims of Islamophobia.
     McAuley, James. "France unveils draft law to boost 'republican principles' as debate over Islamism rages," Washington Post, December 9, 2020.

Page 29: This phenomenon is exemplified by an October 21 Wall Street Journal headline: "France Honors Beheaded Teacher As Symbol of War on Extremism."
     Bisserbe, Noemie, and Matthew Dalton. "France Honors the Memory of Beheaded Teacher Samuel Paty," Wall Street Journal, October 21, 2020.

Page 30: These included stories about US diplomatic efforts, such as the Middle East Peace Deal and US negotiations with the Taliban to form a provisional Afghani government.
     Holland, Steve. "Trump scores diplomatic deal with US allies before election," Reuters, August 13, 2020.

Maizland, Lindsay. "U.S.-Taliban Peace Deal: What to Know," Council on Foreign Relations, March 2, 2020.

Page 30: Iran's Shiite theocracy has managed, at times, to cooperate tactically with deadly Sunni extremist groups—including the Taliban in Afghanistan and the Palestinian groups Hamas and Palestinian Islamic Jihad—against their common foes, the U.S. and Israel, even as Iran has been fighting on the front lines against the Sunni fanatics of Islamic State.
Sadjadpour, Karim. "The Sinister Genius of Qassem Soleimani," Wall Street Journal, January 10, 2020.

Page 31: Although Muslim Americans routinely have to deal with the bigotry of Islamophobia, many have been in denial for far too long about the anti-black racism among the believers. About a third of American Muslims are African-American and the history of Islam in the United States is deeply connected to the African-American story.
Bayoumi, Moustafa. "Why Did Cup Foods Call the Cops on George Floyd?" New York Times, June 17, 2020.

Page 31: This 2017 executive order, disproportionately targeting Muslim majority countries, involved a clearly polemic, anti-Muslim ideology.
"Timeline of the Muslim Ban," ACLU Washington, accessed May 14, 2021.

Additional Sources for our Methods

For additional information on our methods, see https://www.mediaandminorities.org/methods/.

For scholarly publications that use our methods, see: https://www.mediaandminorities.org/publications/.